The School Leadership Pipeline: Ensuring Robust Leadership Development at Independent Schools

Amada Torres, VP, of Studies, Insights and Research, NAIS
Liz Duffy, President, ISS
The Leadership Pipeline
Women in The Workplace
Women in the Workplace, 2018

- Comprehensive study by Lean In and McKinsey & Company on the state of women in corporate America – conducted annually since 2015
- 279 companies employing more than 13 million people shared their pipeline data and completed a survey of HR practices
- Plus, more than 64,000 employees completed a survey designed to explore their experiences regarding gender, opportunity, career and work-life issues
- Key Finding:

  In corporate America, women fall behind early and continue to lose ground with every step, and women of color are particularly disadvantaged.
Female Representation in the Corporate Pipeline (Women in the Workplace, 2016, 2017, 2018)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Entry</th>
<th>Manager</th>
<th>Senior Manager</th>
<th>VP</th>
<th>SVP</th>
<th>C-Suite</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2018</td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>21%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Race & Gender Representation in the Corporate Pipeline *(Women in the Workplace, 2018)*

- **White Men**
  - Entry: 36%
  - Manager: 46%
  - Senior Manager: 52%
  - VP: 59%
  - SVP: 67%
  - C-Suite: 68%

- **White Women**
  - Entry: 31%
  - Manager: 27%
  - Senior Manager: 26%
  - VP: 24%
  - SVP: 19%
  - C-Suite: 19%

- **Men of Color**
  - Entry: 16%
  - Manager: 16%
  - Senior Manager: 13%
  - VP: 12%
  - SVP: 9%
  - C-Suite: 9%

- **Women of Color**
  - Entry: 17%
  - Manager: 12%
  - Senior Manager: 8%
  - VP: 6%
  - SVP: 4%
  - C-Suite: 4%
Women in the Workplace, 2017 - Findings

• **PROMOTIONS & RAISES** - Women are progressing more slowly than men, and it’s not for lack of asking

• **MENTORSHIP & SPONSORSHIP** - Women are less likely to interact regularly with senior leaders or to receive advice from managers and senior leaders on career advancement

• **ATTRITION** - Women are not leaving their companies at high rates than men, and very few plan to leave the workforce to focus on family

• **WORK/FAMILY JUGGLING** – many women still work a “double shift”

• **ATTITUDES** – Men think women are doing better than they really are

• **CONFIDENCE** - So, perhaps unsurprisingly, women are less optimistic that they can reach the top.
Women in the Workplace, 2018 – Recommendations

Six actions that companies need to take to make progress on diversity:

1. Get the basics right - targets, reporting and accountability
2. Ensure that hirings and promotions are fair
3. Make senior leaders and managers champions of diversity
4. Foster an inclusive and respectful culture
5. Make the Only experience rare
6. Offer employees the flexibility to fit work into their lives
Overview of NAIS Data
The Gender and Color of Leadership in NAIS Schools, 2019

Source: NAIS DASL
Further Breakdown of NAIS Data, 2019

- Associate Heads: 55%
- Assistant Heads: 59%
- Upper School Heads: 43%
- Middle School Heads: 55%
- Lower School Heads: 83%
- Business Officers: 56%
- Dir. of Development: 79%
- Dir. of Admissions: 79%
- Dir. of Financial Aid: 76%
- Dir. of Diversity: 67%

Source: NAIS DASL
The NAIS Education Pipeline for Women

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Teachers</th>
<th>Administrators</th>
<th>Head</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2018-2019</td>
<td>68%</td>
<td>69%</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017-2018</td>
<td>68%</td>
<td>69%</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016-2017</td>
<td>68%</td>
<td>68%</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: NAIS DASL
The Education Pipeline at Your School

Entry → Manager → Senior Manager → VP → SVP → C-Suite

Teacher → Teacher-Leader → Dept Head → Dean/Director → Principal/Asst. Head → Head
NAIS Research Description: Goals

1. Understand the dynamics in the recruiting process that contribute to or hinder the hiring of white women and women and men of color for headship positions

2. Assess current independent school administrators’ career aspirations, interest in a headship position, barriers and motivators of the position

3. Determine the perceptions of the hiring process among potential candidates who are White women and People of Color

Source: People of Color and White Women in Independent School Headship, NAIS, 2018
NAIS Research: Methodology

- **1st phase**: 45-minute phone interviews with 6 search firms, 10 search committee chairs, and 20 potential headship candidates who were women and men of color.

- **2nd phase**: 20-minute survey with potential headship candidates who were women and People of Color (313 white women, 82 women of color, and 47 men of color).

Source: People of Color and White Women in Independent School Headship, NAIS, 2018
What Candidates Perceive: “Hard” Skills
Total, n=442

Success in Achieving Qualifications
(Rated 4-5 out of 5)

Improvement Areas
- Financial management and budgeting experience
- Fundraising and development experience
- Experience as a school head at another school
- Degree from an Ivy League school

Strengths
- Academic leadership experience
- Experience managing faculty or staff
- Management experience
- Experience working with parents
- Experience working with faculty, staff, and/or families with different demographic or cultural backgrounds
- Master’s degree or higher
- Admissions and enrollment experience

Secondary Improvement
- Teaching experience

Source: People of Color and White Women in Independent School Headship, NAIS, 2018

#WLead #NAISAC @ISSCommunity #issedu
What Candidates Perceive: “Softer” Skills
Total, n=442

Source: People of Color and White Women in Independent School Headship, NAIS, 2018
Search Firms: Qualifications Sought in Head Candidates

Requirements:
• Academic leadership experience
• Management experience
• Master’s degree
• Experience at similar schools
• Experience working with parents and faculty
• Experience related to school’s short- and long-term goals

Preferences:
• Teaching background
• Fundraising and development experience
• Financial management and budgeting
• Admissions and enrollment experience

Source: People of Color and White Women in Independent School Headship, NAIS, 2018
Search Firms: Preferences & Desires

• **Preferred Personality Characteristics:**
  • Empathetic head
  • Strong communication skills
  • Fit with the school culture and be part of the team.

• **Desired Life Experiences:**
  • Life experiences that demonstrate a candidate’s knowledge of independent schools
  • Broad perspective
  • Commitment to the school’s mission.

Source: People of Color and White Women in Independent School Headship, NAIS, 2018
Firm, Candidate Disconnects

Experience at Similar Schools – Candidates thought this was the least important qualification.

Prior Experience as a Head – Having this “proven” experience is a key factor to search firms and committees.

Personal Experiences – While not required, search firms and committees look for experiences that they say set candidates apart. Candidates often view these characteristics as “not necessary.”

Source: People of Color and White Women in Independent School Headship, NAIS, 2018
The Hiring Process: Impacts & Issues for Women and People of Color

• Expressed Qualification Mismatch – Division leaders and assistant heads are considered the strongest candidates

• Leadership Experiences Undervalued – Business officers, admissions officers, and diversity practitioners are seen as having less relevant experience.

• Employment Location and Environmental “Burden” – People of color and white women must weigh racial and ethnic culture and school community climate issues when assessing job opportunities.

Source: People of Color and White Women in Independent School Headship, NAIS, 2018
Implications & Opportunities
48% of white women have a mentor.

56% of women of color have a mentor.

60% of men of color have a mentor.

My mentor has helped me discover my strengths and areas of growth. She has taught me best practices and given me the opportunity to practice what I’ve learned. She also puts a lot of trust in me and has given me many leadership opportunities. —White Woman

She has given me a path and shown me how to have a professional life that is fulfilling and meaningful to me on a personal level. —Woman of Color

My mentor has allowed me to articulate a career path while offering suggestions, support, and resources to benchmark along the journey. —Man of Color

Source: People of Color and White Women in Independent School Headship, NAIS, 2018
Career Sponsorship in NAIS Cohort

- 21% of men of color have a sponsor
- 21% of women of color have a sponsor
- 12% of white women have a sponsor

How Sponsor Helped...

Fiercely advocating for me in searches, as a reference and using her position to make sure my candidacy is considered highly. — Man of Color

He is a recruiter and inspires me to apply for positions that I may not be qualified for but would be able to do. My current position was originally part-time and he helped me negotiate a full-time position. — Woman of Color

My sponsor was an advocate for me and my contributions to the school community when I presented a request for a significant promotion in the past year. I was successful in obtaining this promotion in part because of their guidance. — White Woman

Source: People of Color and White Women in Independent School Headship, NAIS, 2018
Perceptions on School Support

School is supportive of professional development goals:
- 65% of white women
- 68% of women of color
- 85% of men of color

School is supportive of desire to become school head:
- 32% of white women
- 34% of women of color
- 57% of men of color

Source: People of Color and White Women in Independent School Headship, NAIS, 2018
Perceptions of Upward Mobility

School would consider for headship if position became available

- 28% of men of color
- 18% of women of color
- 24% of white women

Reasons school would not consider them

- I don’t feel they would accept an African American in that position. —Man of Color
- The consultation industry has convinced independent schools that schools must look for only external candidates. —Man of Color
- I am still in the early stages of my career, and I intentionally want to have a more relaxed role in the school at this moment in time because I am building my family. I also think that I have yet to prove myself in leadership roles. —Woman of Color
- My school hasn't hired from within for the last 5 head searches... and I don't think we will. Also, my school has never hired a woman. —White Woman

Source: People of Color and White Women in Independent School Headship, NAIS, 2018
Reaching for the Top: Who Applied?

- 32% of men of color
- 23% of women of color
- 20% of white women

Number of Position

- 1-2 positions: 60%
- 3-5 positions: 28%
- 6-10 positions: 6%
- 10+ positions: 3%

Source: People of Color and White Women in Independent School Headship, NAIS, 2018
Talent: School & Industry Cultivation

Candidates welcome general coaching and career guidance from hiring committees, search firms, and recently hired heads of schools. They also want coaching on matters specific to leadership as men and women of color and white women.
Provide professional development opportunities to improve my leadership skills
Involve me in financial and budgeting processes and decision making
Give me academic leadership roles
Recommend me for open school headships
Have me supervise other staff and/or faculty
Involve me in admissions and enrollment processes and decision making
Other
None of the above

Source: People of Color and White Women in Independent School Headship, NAIS, 2018
Hiring-Specific Professional Experience

(Total, n=77)

- Informational overview of hiring process: 61%
- Discussion with recently hired school heads: 53%
- Coaching on issues specific to women and/or people of color in the hiring process: 49%
- Q&A session with hiring committees and search firms: 48%
- Resume assistance: 30%
- Mock interview practice: 19%
- Other: 19%

Source: People of Color and White Women in Independent School Headship, NAIS, 2018
Most Helpful Hiring-Specific Professional Experience

Q&A session with hiring committees and search firms (73% of responses) ranked highest, followed by discussion with recently hired school heads (54% of responses), coaching on issues specific to women and/or people of color in the hiring process (46% of responses), mock interview practice (36% of responses), informational overview of hiring process (30% of responses), and resume assistance (29% of responses). 6% of respondents chose other options, and 5% chose none of the above. 

Source: People of Color and White Women in Independent School Headship, NAIS, 2018
Candidate Feedback: Process Intensity

• Candidates called attention to the intensity of the hiring process including the amount of time required to be away from their schools. Some also thought the interview requirements were cumbersome.

• Search firms and committees should consider ways to minimize the disruption of the interview process, including limiting travel requirements and the number of interviews.

Source: People of Color and White Women in Independent School Headship, NAIS, 2018
Observations for Schools & Decision-Makers

• Racially and culturally diverse candidates are most interested in heading diverse, progressive schools.

• A majority of candidates surveyed believe the hiring process is biased and expect to be considered “non-traditional candidates” if they apply to headship.

• Individuals with Upper School academic experience appear to be advantaged in the process

• Current heads of school are advantaged in the process

Source: People of Color and White Women in Independent School Headship, NAIS, 2018
Summary: Talent Cultivation

• People of color and white women want leadership development opportunities.

• Candidates welcome general coaching and career guidance, and specific coaching on issues relevant to people of color and women.

• Staff in non-academic positions and women are less confident about seeking headships. They may require proactive outreach and targeted professional development to encourage their participation in the search process.

Source: People of Color and White Women in Independent School Headship, NAIS, 2018
Questions